

## Executive

27 March 2007

Report of the Director, City Strategy

## Future York Race meetings – Traffic Management Arrangements

### Summary

- 1 This report advises Members of the results of the traffic management arrangements adopted during the 2006 racing season and makes appropriate recommendations concerning future York race meetings.

### Background

- 2 At its meeting on the 7 February 2006 the Executive approved a draft York Race meetings Traffic Management Plan for use during the 2006 racing season.
- 3 The Plan sought to:
  - Provide a plan which catered for three race meeting 'groups':
    - the Ebor festival
    - the John Smith's meeting
    - all other race meetings
  - Ensure that the Traffic Management Plan applicable to each 'group' was well publicised and understood by the travelling public
- 4 Key objectives of the Plan were:-
  - To insulate the race meetings from the rest of the city
  - To minimise the impact of the race meeting on local residents
  - To minimise policing requirements
- 5 General concepts adopted were to:-
  - Concentrate all road travel journeys for all meetings so as to approach from the A64
  - Concentrate all public transport connections so as to operate in a coordinated and managed way

- Isolate the South Bank residential area during busy meetings in such a way that the local community was protected from the effects of the meeting

6 The Plan is summarised as follows:-

- All vehicles wishing to park at the race course were required to approach only from the A64
- For all meetings other than the Ebor and Johns Smiths all traffic was directed to use Sim Balk Lane and Bishopthorpe Road to the main car park area at Bustardthorpe. For the Ebor and John Smith an additional stream was created and directed to use Tadcaster Road to a subsidiary car park on the Knavesmire.
- For the Ebor meeting only the exit from the A64, Leeds direction and road to the London Bridge junction was made one way during the inbound phase so as to facilitate two lanes of traffic to leave the A64 and form the streams mentioned above at a very early stage. This meant that traffic travelling to Copmanthorpe out of the city was diverted so as to use the Manor Heath (Askham Bryan) junction off the A64.
- For the Ebor and John Smith meetings only Campleshon Road and Knavesmire Road was made one way between Bishopthorpe Road and Knavesmire Gates – and in that direction.
- For every meeting in the year traffic leaving the race course parking areas was required to rejoin the A64, retracing the route used when entering the meeting. This meant that for every meeting during the outbound phase traffic travelling on Sim Balk Lane would not be allowed to turn right towards Tadcaster Road
- At times during the outbound phase of the Ebor meeting traffic was prevented from turning into St Georges Place when travelling out of the city so as to minimise obstruction to general city traffic leaving the city. This turn was stopped when judged necessary by the Head of Network Management to prevent excessive tailbacks in towards the city centre.
- Similarly there were times during the outbound phase when the frequent operation of the Pelican crossing on Tadcaster Road adjacent to Nelsons Lane created excessive tailbacks in both the outbound general city centre traffic and that leaving the racecourse. At such times and again on the instructions of the Head of Network

management the signals were switched off and the crossing manually controlled.

- To prevent South Bank Roads being used as 'rat runs' all of the junctions with roads leading into that area with Campleshon Road and Knavesmire Road were closed off for the John Smith and Ebor race meetings. All roads inside the South Bank area thus remained available for normal use by residents and businesses. A limited amount of temporary no waiting restrictions were used to keep emergency access routes clear
- For safety reasons temporary restrictions were also used on Albermarle Road, Church Lane and the rural sections of Bishopthorpe Road and Sim Balk
- Specific arrangements for Buses, Taxis, Private Hire, walking and cycling were introduced for all race meetings.

7 Apart from the limited parking control measures outlined above no other waiting restrictions were used throughout the 2006 season.

8 The late introduction of charging for car parking during the main race meetings came at a point where it was not possible to obtain the required legal authority to introduce extra temporary waiting restrictions. This was of some concern to your Officers who could only monitor the situation with a view to possible additional measures being used in subsequent years. In the event, however, whilst the volume of on street parking increased when compared to previous years it was minimal in extent and at no point did it create unacceptable difficulties for the general movement of traffic. One resident, however, was vociferous in his complaints over the impact of the extra parking upon his immediate environment.

## **Policing in 2006**

9 Following a late withdrawal of the normally present traffic management support from the police (due to a legal ruling which clarified police powers in non emergency situations.) A number of modifications had to be made to enable the originally planned system to operate completely without any police officers present. The changes made were:

- The abandonment of the proposed outbound management arrangements at the Tadcaster Road/Moor Lane roundabout for major race meetings.

(This would have seen the route to the A64 closed as during the Ascot meeting and traffic diverted via Moor Lane so as to minimise delay to inbound traffic heading for Sim Balk Lane).

- Significant modification of the proposed One Way system for Campleshon Road/Knavesmire Road which had been planned for every race meeting in the year and had significant reliance upon police officers.
- The introduction of yellow box markings on the Tadcaster Road/Moor Lane roundabout (so as to prevent the junction 'locking' during the inbound phase of major meetings).
- The use of additional staff to control the St Helens Road junction and the Tadcaster Road Sim Balk Lane junction.
- The use of temporary traffic signals (manually operated) to control:
  - the junction of Bustardthorpe car park and Bishopthorpe Road
  - the junction of Church Lane with Bishopthorpe Road
  - the junction of Church lane with Sim Balk Lane
- The use of additional staff in the Urban Traffic Control (UTC) Room to actively manage the traffic signal network.
- The installation of a CCTV web camera to cover the Knavesmire gates area and linked to the UTC Room.
- Modifications to the Knavesmire Road one way system for major meetings so as to allow a contraflow into the Knavesmire car park from Tadcaster Road. (this was achieved by coning off a lane on the 'wrong' side of the road and meant that the complex control of Knavesmire gates junction – only possible with the use of two police officers – could be reduced to a simple arrangement controlled by the main Traffic Lights).

10 With one notable exception the measures proved to be successful, albeit that this came at a cost and illustrated that had such police regulations to have been in effect for Royal Ascot the traffic management outcome might have been very different. Hosting such an event in the changed policing circumstances in the future must therefore be questionable.

11 The exception concerned an accident to a young cyclist who was in collision with a bus on Knavesmire Road. The boy was not seriously hurt. The accident occurred where the cycle route crosses Knavesmire Road and appears to be as a result of the cyclist not recognising the temporarily changed set of circumstances on Knavesmire Road (this was advised at the crossing point by the use of signs). It is impossible to say if this accident would not have occurred if the original plan had been employed as there is always an inherent danger in making temporary changes to a route used frequently by any individual of whatever age. The accident does,

however, highlight the need to actively address this crossing point during future race meetings.

## **Outcome of the 2006 Race Traffic Management Plan**

- 12 With the notable exception mentioned above the Plan used worked exceptionally well and delivered fully upon its objectives. Whilst not so successful as the Ascot Plan in isolating the city from the race meeting nevertheless the impact of race traffic upon the life of the rest of the city was minimal. Compared to the pre Ascot traffic situation there has been a significant improvement and delays to the non race traffic are at an acceptable level.
- 13 Delays are still however present on the highway network which can be eliminated over time by educating race goers to follow the advised traffic route into the race meeting. It was noticeable that traffic on the A59/Dalton Terrace route was still appreciably higher than on a non race day. This meant that delays at Knavesmire gates were higher than can be expected over time. Observation suggest that the largest contingent who did not follow the advised traffic route were actually Race Committee members. There was, however a high element of general public traffic that ignored the advised route during the John Smith meeting and in particular coaches.
- 14 Throughout the entire racing season traffic was able to enter the racecourse between 8 and 12 minutes after having left the A64. For traffic leaving the now main car parking area at Bustardthorpe the typical journey time from car park exit to A64 was some 7 minutes. This was also the experience of those leaving the now subsidiary Knavesmire car park. Delays to non race traffic on Blossom Street, The Mount, Tadcaster Road and Bishopthorpe Road were too small to reliably measure.
- 15 There were, however some delays on the A64 during the inbound phase caused by drivers switching lanes to 'cut in' from the outside to nearside lane close to the Bond Hill Ash junction (turn off for Tadcaster Road). Traffic on the subsidiary Knavesmire car park also had long delays during the Ebor meeting in being able to get into a position to leave the car park and join the highway network.
- 16 Officers received only one complaint from residents/businesses in the South Bank area concerning traffic or parking conditions. A number were however received thanking staff for the introduction of a balanced set of measures which allowed them to go about their normal business relatively unaffected.
- 17 The complaint concerned the level of on street parking and the operation of an arrangement by the private hire/taxi trade to drop and collect pre booked customers at a location close to the race course but sufficiently far away that the vehicles concerned were not affected

by any traffic delays that might have occurred. This location (Albermarle Road) was not designated by the city council nor had/has the council any powers to prevent it as investigation revealed that what was taking place was an entirely lawful use of the highway.

## **Prerequisites for the 2007 Race season**

- 18 Planning for the 2007 race season needs to take into account the following lessons learnt since hosting Royal Ascot:
- The Traffic Management Plan needs to be fully functional without reliance on any Police officers to control or manage traffic
  - Only a Police officer or a Police Community Support Officer has the lawful authority to stop or direct traffic
  - On the advice of Counsel, the council is unable to recover any costs that it incurs from any third party as a direct result of responding to traffic conditions created by the hosting of race meetings on the Knavesmire
  - Additional safety measures need to be in place at the Knavesmire Road cycle crossing during race meetings, these also cannot be recharged to any third party

## **Discussion**

- 19 Clearly the criteria outlined in paragraph 18 above are onerous. The council is in effect caught between its Statutory duty to minimise congestion on race days and its ability to fund appropriate mitigating measures. It has, moreover, to manage traffic in such a way that it is not reliant upon police officers and which uses authorised devices such as traffic signals to stop and control traffic movements. Finally and again because of the Statutory duty imposed by Parliament, the council cannot simply do nothing.
- 20 The key factor in determining the response to a race day situation is thus how much money is available to support the measures that the council is obliged to fund. The 2006/7 council budget, as those in previous years, has no specific funding allocated. Thus any work undertaken to mitigate the impact of any traffic conditions, planned or otherwise, called upon existing service budgets. This has been a traditional approach and for relatively small sums, although difficult to accommodate, can be managed. To deal with the consequence of race meetings, has, as has been amply demonstrated during Royal Ascot and for the following race season, a significant cost and well beyond the means of existing budgets to accommodate. Officers in recognition of this serious difficulty thus sought as part of the 2007/8

budget process a specific and on going allocation of funds to managing all future race meetings.

- 21 At the time that the request had to be made for funding to support traffic management measures for race meetings the precise extent of those measures was not fully known. It has subsequently been recognized that the sum requested (and subsequently obtained - £30,000) was insufficient to provide for all of the measures that would ideally be required. The Traffic Management Plan has therefore been designed to reflect the budget available.
- 22 Working closely with Race Committee officers the exact need for traffic management for each day of each race meeting has been critically examined. Whilst not now directly involved the advice of the of the police has also been sought in the light of their experience in past years. This work has produced the following outcome:

Event	Day	Traffic Management	
		Inbound	Outbound
May Festival	Wed	Standard	SBL
May Festival	Thur	Standard	SBL
May Festival	Fri	Standard	SBL
Timeform Charity	Fri	Standard	SBL
Timeform Charity	Sat	Standard	SBL
John Smiths	Fri	Standard	SBL
John Smiths	Sat	Major	Major
Musical Showcase Evening	Thur	None	None
Musical Showcase	Sat	Standard	SBL
Ebor	Wed	Ebor	Ebor
Ebor	Thur	Ebor	Ebor
Ebor	Fri	Ebor	Ebor
Late Summer	Wed	Standard	SBL
Late Summer	Sat	None	None
October Meet	Fri	Standard	SBL
October Meet	Sat	Standard	SBL

## Key to Traffic Management

Standard - Sim Balk Lane main access to parking

Major - Tadcaster Road in use to additional parking + Campleshon Road

Ebor - Tadcaster Road in use, Campleshon Road and TWO exit lanes from A64

SBL- local arrangements at Sim Balk Lane to allow race and city traffic to flow together

- 23 It will be seen from the above that of the 16 days of racing in a normal race year, 6 would have no traffic management in place, 6 would have a small element, 1 would have a greater amount and only 3 would have measures of any significance. It should be noted that on all 16 days however there would be some limited temporary no waiting restrictions in place to protect the emergency services access routes in the South Bank area as has been done for every race meeting for the past 10 years.
- 24 The detailed description of the traffic management measures which make up the schemes described as Standard, Major, Ebor and SBL will be found in Annex A. These measures take fully into account the criteria outlined in paragraph 18 and have been trimmed back so as to be affordable within the £30,000 funding available. All measures required by the Race Committee to inform, direct and manage their customers on the public highway or within the racecourse would be funded directly by the Race Committee. It has been agreed that some costs would be shared as there are joint benefits.
- 25 In terms of the Knavesmire Road cycle crossing this will be directly affected on 4 days out of the 16. On these days Campleshon Road and Knavesmire Road will become one way (with flow towards Knavesmire Gates) but with a contra flow lane on the Knavesmire side to allow access to secondary parking on the Knavesmire for the entry phase. For the exit phase the Knavesmire Road one way direction would be maintained but Campleshon Road would revert to 2 way traffic.
- 26 Options considered by Officers for responding to the safety issue posed by the interaction of race traffic and users of the cycle route were:
- a. Close the route and require all users to stay on the main roads
  - b. Reduce the width of the route at the point where it connects with Knavesmire Road, introduce chicanes either side of the road and large signs advising cyclist to dismount
  - c. Permanently move the central island so as to allow its retention on these 4 days in a year. This would require the island to be reduced in width.
- 27 Option [a] was discounted on grounds of safety. This option would bring users into close proximity to a great number of vehicles, many if



which would be buses or coaches. The users of the cycle route would thus be placed in greater danger than that which the solution seeks to deal with.

- 28 Option [c] would cost in the region of £12,000 and is perhaps something that might be considered in due course. Officers feel however, that the justification for the spending of such a sum is currently not sufficient given the potential calls that there are on the 2007/8 Capital Programme. Option [b] has therefore been included in the costings for the 2007/8 racing season. Members are requested to endorse this decision.

## Options and Analysis

- 29 Members have two options with regard to the Traffic management arrangements for 2007:

[a] Take no action

If this option were to be selected the council will lay itself open to potential legal challenge that it has not responded to its Statutory Network Management Duty under the Traffic Management Act 2004. This states:

**“It is the duty of a local authority to manage their road network with a view to achieving, so far as may be reasonably practicable having regard to their obligations, policies and objectives the following objectives-**

- 1. securing the expeditious movement of traffic on the authority’s network; and**
- 2. facilitating the expeditious movement of traffic on road networks for which another authority is the traffic authority.”**

In this instance of course there could well be implications in regard to not having traffic management in place which would impact upon the Highways Agency as traffic authority for the A64. This option is not recommended

- [b] Adopt the traffic management plans described in Annex A or as may be modified as required by Members. This option is recommended.

## Traffic Regulation Orders

- 30 The necessary powers to give effect to the Traffic management packages are already in effect as a result of decisions taken in regard to the 2006 racing season. Members at that time authorised the making of a package of Orders which could, at the discretion of the

Head of network management in consultation with the police and the Executive Member be used in any combination necessary to give effect to the package of traffic management measures approved by Members. There is thus no necessity to seek to make fresh regulations for the 2007 or indeed any subsequent seasons.

## Corporate Priorities

- 31 There are no direct links to Corporate Priorities associated with this report but Members should be aware that it is important for the reputation of the Authority that the highways of the city are managed efficiently and effectively during race meetings.

## Implications

### Financial

- 32 Annex B details the works required within each package of Traffic management measures, the organisation who will fund the relevant measure and the cost. From this it can be seen that the direct and shared costs that need to be met by the city council are:

Traffic Management package	Direct costs £	Shared costs £	Total £
Standard	3,100	360	3,460
Major	3,750	2350	6,100
Ebor	12,450	7,310	19,760
Sim Balk Lane	Nil	Nil	Nil
<b>TOTALS</b>			<b>29,320</b>

These costs include that associated with communicating the Plan.

- 33 As mentioned previously a Growth Bid was sought to fund this work which was successful and thus the costs can be contained within that budget.
- 34 The racecourse will be funding their own operations and sharing the cost of those works which have a joint benefit. Whilst your Officers are not party to the exact costs that they will incur it is understood that these will be in the region of £76,000. This will be offset by some £21,000 of income from the charges made for on course parking at busy meetings, leaving a net cost to them of some £45,000.

### Human Resources (HR)

Network Management staff working to cover Saturday meetings would be on a voluntary basis (staff would however be paid at their

appropriate overtime rate). The possibility may therefore arise that this duty could not be covered as staff cannot be required to work outside their contracted hours.

### **Further implications**

There are no Equalities, Legal, Crime and Disorder, Information Technology, Property or other implications

### **Risk Management**

- 35 There is a high reputational risk to the authority should it not manage the consequences of a race meeting effectively. However on the basis that the measures recommend are adopted the council will be seen to be responding and whilst inevitably these measures will not satisfy all sectors of the community past experience has demonstrated that they will be effective in balancing the demands of non race traffic, with race traffic and within the budget available. Overall therefore the risk score is considered to be less than 16. (the point where a clear action plan and possibly further measures would be required to minimise risk).

### **Recommendation**

- 36 It is recommended that:
- i. Option [b] in paragraph 26 with regard to the measures to be used at the crossing of the Knavesmire cycle route and Knavesmire Road be adopted (narrowing at junction, chicanes and extensive signing)
  - ii. The Traffic management arrangements described in Annex A be endorsed as appropriate for the 2007 racing season.

Reason: for the efficient and effective management of the highways of the city on race days in accordance with the council's Statutory Duty under the Traffic Management Act 2004.

### **Contact Details**

**Author:**  
Peter Evely  
Head of Network Management  
Phone No 551414

**Chief Officer Responsible for the report:**  
Bill Woolley, Director, City Strategy

**For further information please contact the author of the report**

## **Background Papers**

Report to The Executive dated 20 December 2005 – Future York Race Meetings

<b>Legal</b>	
<b>Financial</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b>Human Resources</b>	
<b>Crime and Disorder</b>	
<b>Sustainability</b>	
<b>Equalities</b>	
<b>Other</b>	